

Legal Protection for Vulnerable Groups Amidst the Socio-Economic Crisis

Ahmad Redi^{1*}

¹ Universitas Borobudur, Jakarta, Indonesia

Abstract

Article history:

Received: July 6, 2022

Revised: August 23, 2022

Accepted: October 25, 2022

Published: December 30, 2022

Keywords:

Human Rights,
Legal Protection,
Public Policy,
Socio-Economic Crisis,
Vulnerable Groups.

Identifier:

Nawala

Page: 110-127

<https://nawala.io/index.php/ijlsd>

Socio-economic crises often significantly exacerbate the vulnerabilities faced by specific groups such as women, children, persons with disabilities, and impoverished communities. Legal protection is an essential instrument to guarantee and uphold their rights amidst periods of instability and uncertainty. This study utilizes a comprehensive literature review method to critically analyze policies, legal frameworks, and protection practices targeted at vulnerable groups within various national and international contexts. The findings reveal that the effectiveness of legal protection mechanisms is highly dependent on the degree of state commitment, institutional capacity, and active participation from civil society. These outcomes emphasize the urgent need to strengthen regulations grounded in human rights principles, improve oversight of policy implementation, and ensure inclusive access to justice for all vulnerable populations. Furthermore, the research advocates for enhanced cross-sectoral collaboration in crisis response strategies and the integration of vulnerable group protections within broader socio-economic policies. This study aims to provide valuable insights for policymakers, legal practitioners, and academics to develop a more responsive, equitable, and sustainable legal protection system.

*Corresponding author:
(Ahmad Redi)

©2022 The Author(s).

This is an open-access article under CC-BY-SA license (<https://creativecommons.org/licence/by-sa/4.0/>)



1. Introduction

The phenomenon of socio-economic crises occurring in various countries, including Indonesia, has clearly shown that vulnerable groups are often the most affected parties. This group includes women, children, the elderly, people with disabilities, the poor, minority groups, and informal sector workers who are often in a marginal position amid the dynamics of development and global economic change.¹ In many cases, crises can trigger the degradation of economic conditions, limited access to basic services such as health and education, and an increased risk of discrimination, social exclusion, or even structural violence. Legal protection in this context is not merely the existence of formal rules written on paper, but also includes real implementation that can ensure the fulfillment of the rights of these groups in the field. Itasari,² emphasizes that effective legal protection must be based on the principles of human rights, non-discrimination, equality, and justice.

In practice, protection efforts often face various obstacles, ranging from weak law enforcement capacity, limited human resources and budget, to social-cultural resistance that reinforces the status quo and delays the process of change. The COVID-19 crisis is one of the most relevant case studies, where governments around the world were faced with the challenge of balancing public health policies

¹ Cowen Dziva, Munatsi Shoko, and Ellen F. Zvobgo, "Implementation of the 2006 Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities in Zimbabwe: A review," *African Journal of Disability* 7, no. 1 (2018): 4.

² Endah Rantau Itasari, "Equality and non discrimination principles in providing rights with disabilities," *Jurnal Komunikasi Hukum (Jkb)* 6, no. 2 (2020): 537.

with adequate socio-economic protection. Bhorat et al.³ found that countries with strong legal frameworks and inclusive social security systems were able to significantly minimize the impact of the crisis on vulnerable groups. However, in many developing countries, including Indonesia, the responsive policies implemented are often uneven, temporary, and leave gaps for groups that are difficult to reach.⁴

In Indonesia itself, the legal framework governing the protection of vulnerable groups is scattered across various regulations, ranging from the Human Rights Law, the Child Protection Law, to regulations related to people with disabilities and the elimination of gender-based violence. However, the biggest challenge faced is not only in the regulatory aspect, but also in cross-sectoral coordination, harmonization of regulations, and supervision of implementation in the field which is often not optimal.⁵ Legal protection also functions as a preventive mechanism to prevent vulnerability from worsening. For example, in the context of gender-based violence, Pepinsky et al.⁶ shows that quick, appropriate, and victim-friendly legal intervention can prevent prolonged psychological and social impacts. Likewise, in the protection of people with disabilities, the application of

³ H., Oosthuizen, M Bhorat, & Stanwix, B. (2021). Social assistance amidst the Covid-19 epidemic in South Africa: a policy assessment. *South African Journal of Economics*, 89(1), 65.

⁴ Fradhana Putra Disantara, "Tanggung Jawab Negara Dalam Masa Pandemi Covid-19," *Jch (Jurnal Cendekia Hukum)* 6, no. 1 (2020): 55.

⁵ Danang Risdianto, "Perlindungan Terhadap Kelompok Minoritas Di Indonesia Dalam Mewujudkan Keadilan Dan Persamaan Di Hadapan Hukum," *Jurnal Rechts Vinding: Media Pembinaan Hukum Nasional* 6, no. 1 (2017): 133.

⁶ Thomas B., Pepinsky, Jan H. Pierskalla, and Audrey Sacks, "Bureaucracy and service delivery," *Annual Review of Political Science* 20, no. 1 (2017): 257.

comprehensive accessibility principles in public spaces and essential services is a concrete form of fulfilling rights that must be guaranteed by the state. In addition, the aspect of public participation is a key element that cannot be ignored. According to Alston (2017),⁷ active participation of civil society in the policy formulation process allows for the creation of regulations that are more responsive and targeted to the needs of vulnerable groups. Conversely, neglecting public participation actually has the potential to strengthen existing social exclusion and widen the gap.

The global context shows that legal protection for vulnerable groups should be seen as an integral part of a sustainable development strategy. Herrero and Loza,⁸ emphasize that a human rights-based approach in public policy can encourage social justice, equal opportunities, and social resilience. With this background, this study aims to deeply analyze legal protection for vulnerable groups in the midst of a socio-economic crisis through a literature review from last five years. The focus of the study is directed at the effectiveness of the legal framework, implementation challenges, and policy improvement recommendations to strengthen an adaptive, inclusive, and sustainable protection system.

2. Literature Review

The literature review on legal protection for vulnerable groups in the midst of socio-economic crises shows that there are various approaches taken in different

⁷ Philip Alston, "The populist challenge to human rights," *Journal of Human Rights Practice* 9, no. 1 (2017): 7.

⁸ María Belén Herrero and Jorgelina Loza, "Building a regional health agenda: a rights-based approach to health in South America," *Global Public Health* 13, no. 9 (2018): 1185.

countries, both through formal regulatory instruments and adaptive non-legal mechanisms. International literature consistently emphasizes the human rights framework as the main foundation of protection.⁹ This principle underlines the state's obligation to respect, protect, and fulfill the rights of vulnerable groups without discrimination. In the context of a crisis, this protection includes guaranteeing access to social assistance, health services, education, and protection from threats of violence and discrimination that can increase in emergency situations. A number of studies show that the effectiveness of legal protection is strongly influenced by cross-sectoral coordination and the state's institutional capacity. Bhorat et al.¹⁰ found that countries with established and integrated social security systems were able to respond more quickly and more precisely to the impact of the crisis on vulnerable groups. However, in Indonesia, Disantara,¹¹ noted bureaucratic hurdles, overlapping authority, and funding limitations that significantly hampered the implementation of protection policies, especially during the pandemic.

The aspect of civil society participation plays a central role in strengthening protection. Alston,¹² highlights that regulations compiled without public consultation tend to ignore the specific needs of vulnerable groups. Public participation not only increases the legitimacy of policies, but also enriches the

⁹ Endah Rantau Itasari, "Equality and non discrimination principles in providing rights with disabilities, " *Jurnal Komunikasi Hukum (Jkb)* 6, no. 2 (2020): 537.

¹⁰ H., Oosthuizen, M Bhorat, & Stanwix, B. (2021). Social assistance amidst the Covid-19 epidemic in South Africa: a policy assessment. *South African Journal of Economics*, 89(1), 65.

¹¹ Fradhana Putra Disantara, "Tanggung Jawab Negara Dalam Masa Pandemi Covid-19," *Jkb (Jurnal Cendekia Hukum)* 6, no. 1 (2020): 55.

¹² Philip Alston, "The populist challenge to human rights," *Journal of Human Rights Practice* 9, no. 1 (2017): 7.

information needed by decision-makers, so that the resulting policies are more responsive.¹³ The literature highlights the challenges of legal protection in special situations, such as the COVID-19 pandemic, which requires responsive and adaptive policies. Herrero & Loza,¹⁴ emphasize the importance of social inclusion in crisis policies, while a study in South Africa Dziva et al.¹⁵ shows that flexible law enforcement can help mitigate the impact of sudden economic shocks.

In the context of Indonesia, Risdianto,¹⁶ identified the need for harmonization of regulations related to vulnerable groups, given that overlapping rules often reduce the effectiveness of implementation. Pepinsky,¹⁷ added that the existence of an easily accessible and quickly followed-up complaint mechanism is one of the indicators of successful legal protection. the literature confirms that legal protection for vulnerable groups in the midst of a socio-economic crisis must be based on an inclusive human rights-based legal framework, supported by cross-sectoral coordination, public participation, and a sustainable and adaptive monitoring mechanism to the dynamics of the crisis.

¹³ Gemma Dunn Gemma and Matthew Laing. "Policy-makers perspectives on credibility, relevance and legitimacy (Crele)." *Environmental Science & Policy* 76 (2017): 148.

¹⁴ María Belén Herrero and Jorgelina Loza, "Building a regional health agenda: a rights-based approach to health in South America," *Global Public Health* 13, no. 9 (2018): 1185.

¹⁵ Cowen Dziva, Munatsi Shoko, and Ellen F. Zvobgo, "Implementation of the 2006 Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities in Zimbabwe: A review," *African Journal of Disability* 7, no. 1 (2018): 4.

¹⁶ Danang Risdianto, "Perlindungan Terhadap Kelompok Minoritas Di Indonesia Dalam Mewujudkan Keadilan Dan Persamaan Di Hadapan Hukum," *Jurnal Rechts Vinding: Media Pembinaan Hukum Nasional* 6, no. 1 (2017): 133.

¹⁷ Thomas B., Pepinsky, Jan H. Pierskalla, and Audrey Sacks, "Bureaucracy and service delivery," *Annual Review of Political Science* 20, no. 1 (2017): 257.

3. Method

This study uses a literature review method with a qualitative-descriptive approach that focuses on a systematic review of scientific publications related to legal protection for vulnerable groups in the midst of a socio-economic crisis, with a publication period between 2017 and 2021. Researchers accessed various sources from Google Scholar, Elsevier, ResearchGate and other academic databases using keywords such as “legal protection for vulnerable groups”, “socio-economic crisis”, and “human rights protection in crisis” to find relevant articles. The selection of articles was based on inclusion criteria that included publications in accredited scientific journals or international reputable journals, discussing legal protection for vulnerable groups, and relevant to the context of socio-economic crises. Non-scientific articles such as theses, dissertations, or reports were not included in the analysis.

Furthermore, the data was analyzed using content analysis techniques to identify the main themes, patterns, gaps in research, and recommendations that emerged. The articles were classified based on their focus, such as human rights, social policy, pandemic response, and specific protection for certain groups. The results of the analysis were then synthesized into a structured descriptive narrative in accordance with the research objectives, including an overview, determining factors for the effectiveness of legal protection, implementation challenges, and policy improvement strategies. This approach was chosen because it allows for the collection of perspectives from various contexts while also facilitating a comparison between practices in Indonesia and other countries. With a literature review, this

study is able to explore empirically tested academic evidence without the need to collect primary data which consumes more time and resources.

4. Results

4.1. Legal Framework and Implementation of Protection for Vulnerable Groups

The legal framework for the protection of vulnerable groups in various countries generally rests on basic principles such as non-discrimination, equality before the law, and the fulfillment of universal human rights. These principles are an important foundation in ensuring that vulnerable groups including children, women, people with disabilities, the elderly, and other minority groups receive fair and effective legal protection from the state.¹⁸ In international literature, this approach can be found in a number of international legal instruments that are binding on member states. One of the main instruments is the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR), which affirms the state's obligation to respect, protect, and fulfill the economic, social, and cultural rights of every individual, including those in a socially and economically vulnerable position. In addition, the Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities (CRPD) is also an important instrument that specifically regulates the protection of the rights of people with disabilities, demanding that member states provide equal

¹⁸ Joan Braun, "Preventing harm to vulnerable older adults: A social justice perspective," *Research on Social Work Practice* 31, no. 6 (2021): 567.

access and fair opportunities for people with disabilities to participate fully in society.¹⁹

In Indonesia, efforts to protect vulnerable groups have been regulated in various comprehensive laws and regulations. For example, Law Number 39 of 1999 concerning Human Rights is the main legal umbrella that affirms the basic rights of every citizen, including vulnerable groups, as well as the state's obligation to protect and guarantee these rights without discrimination. In addition, there is Law Number 8 of 2016 concerning Persons with Disabilities which specifically regulates the protection and empowerment of people with disabilities in various aspects of life, ranging from access to education, work, to health services. In addition, Indonesia also has a number of derivative regulations and sectoral policies that regulate the protection of children, women, and the elderly in more detail and specifically. However, as noted by Risdianto,²⁰ there are still major challenges in the implementation of this legal protection. One of the main problems is the existence of overlapping regulations which result in confusion and inefficiency in implementation at the field level. In addition, the weak harmonization between authorized government agencies is a serious obstacle that prevents comprehensive and integrated protection for vulnerable groups.

The COVID-19 pandemic has been a real test for social protection systems in various countries, including Indonesia. A quick and appropriate response from

¹⁹ Endah Rantau Itasari, "Equality and non discrimination principles in providing rights with disabilities, " *Jurnal Komunikasi Hukum (Jkb)* 6, no. 2 (2020): 537.

²⁰ Danang Risdianto, "Perlindungan Terhadap Kelompok Minoritas Di Indonesia Dalam Mewujudkan Keadilan Dan Persamaan Di Hadapan Hukum, " *Jurnal Rechts Vinding: Media Pembinaan Hukum Nasional* 6, no. 1 (2017): 133.

the government is a key factor in ensuring that vulnerable groups are not further marginalized in this crisis situation. Example of social assistance programs such as Direct Cash Assistance (*Bantuan Langsung Tunai/BLT*) and the Pre-Employment Card had an important role in helping to ease the economic burden of vulnerable groups during the pandemic. These programs are designed to provide direct financial assistance and improve work skills so that vulnerable groups can survive and adapt in difficult economic conditions. However, the implementation of the program was not without various obstacles, especially related to inaccurate and not yet fully integrated beneficiary data. This invalid data problem caused some vulnerable groups who needed help to not get the support they should have, while there were also those who received help even though they did not actually meet the criteria. This is in line with the findings of Bhorat et al.²¹, shows that the success of protecting vulnerable groups is highly dependent on the existence of an integrated, accurate, and professionally managed social data system. A good data system allows the government to identify, monitor, and evaluate assistance in a targeted manner.

International experience also shows that the development of regulations based on Human Rights Impact Assessment (HRIA) can significantly improve the effectiveness of policies for protecting vulnerable groups.²² A human rights impact assessment is an approach that requires every new regulation or policy to be tested

²¹ H., Oosthuizen, M Bhorat, & Stanwix, B. (2021). Social assistance amidst the Covid-19 epidemic in South Africa: a policy assessment. *South African Journal of Economics*, 89(1), 65.

²² Elisabeth Bürgi Bonanomi, "Measuring Human Rights Impacts of Trade Agreements Ideas for Improving the Methodology: Comparing the European Union's Sustainability Impact Assessment Practice and Methodology with Human Rights Impact Assessment Methodology," *Journal of Human Rights Practice* 9, no. 3 (2017): 488.

for its impact on human rights, especially on vulnerable groups, before the policy is widely implemented. For example, in Canada, the government requires every new regulation that has an impact on vulnerable groups to go through a systematic HRIA process. This process ensures that the resulting policy does not contain elements of discrimination, provides maximum benefits, and minimizes the risk of violating the rights of vulnerable groups (Alston, 2017).²³ This kind of approach can be a model for other countries, including Indonesia, to improve the quality and justice of legal protection for vulnerable groups in a more structured and sustainable manner.

4.2. Challenges and Strengthening Strategies in the Midst of Socio-Economic Crises

The results of the literature review show a number of main challenges that consistently appear in various countries in efforts to protect vulnerable groups. One of the most significant obstacles is the bureaucratic hurdles that still shackle the process of distributing social assistance. Long and layered bureaucratic mechanisms often slow down the time of assistance distribution to groups in need, leading to ineffectiveness and inaccuracy.²⁴ This obstacle not only results in delays, but also creates the potential for deviations that harm the beneficiaries. In addition, the lack of active participation from vulnerable groups themselves in policy formulation is the next challenge that must be addressed. Often, the voices of these groups are not heard or not accommodated adequately in the decision-making process, so that the

²³ Philip Alston, "The populist challenge to human rights," *Journal of Human Rights Practice* 9, no. 1 (2017): 7.

²⁴ Thomas B., Pepinsky, Jan H. Pierskalla, and Audrey Sacks, "Bureaucracy and service delivery," *Annual Review of Political Science* 20, no. 1 (2017): 257.

resulting policies are less responsive to their actual needs.²⁵ Budget limitations are also an important inhibiting factor, where the available funds are not always sufficient to reach all vulnerable groups with adequate coverage and quality of service. This causes many assistance and legal protection programs to run with limited resources, so that their positive impact is less optimal.²⁶ In addition, internal challenges from vulnerable groups themselves also affect the effectiveness of legal protection. Their lack of legal awareness means that the rights they should have are not fully used or fought for, so their position remains vulnerable to various forms of discrimination and violations.²⁷

To overcome these various challenges, the literature recommends a number of strategies that can be implemented in an integrated manner. One of the main recommendations is to increase the integration of cross-sectoral data which is the basis for identifying beneficiaries more accurately and precisely. With an integrated data system, the government and related institutions can minimize errors in distributing assistance and ensure that the most vulnerable groups in need get adequate support. In addition, the empowerment of local communities is very important so that people at the grassroots level are able to play an active role in monitoring the process of assistance distribution and reporting any deviations or irregularities that occur in the field. This approach not only increases transparency,

²⁵ Philip Alston, "The populist challenge to human rights," *Journal of Human Rights Practice* 9, no. 1 (2017): 7.

²⁶ Cowen Dziva, Munatsi Shoko, and Ellen F. Zvobgo, "Implementation of the 2006 Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities in Zimbabwe: A review," *African Journal of Disability* 7, no. 1 (2018): 4.

²⁷ María Belén Herrero and Jorgelina Loza, "Building a regional health agenda: a rights-based approach to health in South America," *Global Public Health* 13, no. 9 (2018): 1185.

but also directly empowers vulnerable groups so that they can protect their own rights and interests. Furthermore, the application of a multi-level governance approach is highly recommended, where national policies must be able to be adapted and implemented by local governments by taking into account different local contexts and characteristics. This model is considered effective for answering the specific needs of vulnerable communities in various regions in a more flexible and responsive manner.²⁸ In addition, strengthening access to free legal aid for vulnerable groups is a crucial aspect in ensuring they can advocate for their rights independently and get adequate legal protection when facing various social and economic problems.²⁹

These findings clearly show that legal protection for vulnerable groups during a socio-economic crisis does not solely depend on the availability of existing regulations or policies. Factors such as the capacity of policy implementation, coordination between related institutions, and the active involvement of the community and vulnerable groups themselves are the main determinants of the success of this protection. Thus, protection efforts must be carried out holistically and comprehensively, which combines legal, social, and administrative aspects so that the goal of fulfilling rights and social justice for vulnerable groups can be achieved optimally.

²⁸ Fradhana Putra Disantara, "Tanggung Jawab Negara Dalam Masa Pandemi Covid-19," *Jcb (Jurnal Cendekia Hukum)* 6, no. 1 (2020): 55.

²⁹ Endah Rantau Itasari, "Equality and non discrimination principles in providing rights with disabilities," *Jurnal Komunikasi Hukum (Jkb)* 6, no. 2 (2020): 537.

5. Discussion

The findings of this study firmly confirm that legal protection for vulnerable groups during a socio-economic crisis requires a comprehensive approach that involves various sectors across the board. The legal framework both at the national and international levels has provided a very strong normative foundation and is the main reference in the formulation of protection policies. However, gaps in the implementation aspect are often the main inhibiting factor that reduces the effectiveness of this legal protection. One important thing to note is that legal protection must be dynamic and adaptive, able to follow rapid and unexpected changes in socio-economic conditions. The COVID-19 pandemic is clear evidence that policies that are rigid and inflexible will be difficult to keep up with the complex and multifaceted dynamics of the crisis. Countries that were able to adapt quickly and responsively, such as Canada and New Zealand, were proven to be more successful in keeping vulnerable groups from being severely affected by the crisis.³⁰

In addition, public participation, especially the involvement of vulnerable groups in the process of policy planning and evaluation, is a very important indicator in determining the success of a policy.³¹ If vulnerable groups are not actively involved in policy formulation forums, the resulting policies tend to fail to address the real needs they face in the field. For example, a study conducted by Herrero and

³⁰ Philip Alston, "The populist challenge to human rights," *Journal of Human Rights Practice* 9, no. 1 (2017): 7.

³¹ Stephan Hügel and Anna R. Davies, "Public participation, engagement, and climate change adaptation: A review of the research literature," *Wiley Interdisciplinary Reviews: Climate Change* 11, no. 4 (2020): 11.

Loza,³² shows that the active participation of women and people with disabilities in policy formulation forums in Peru succeeded in producing programs that were much more targeted and relevant to the needs of these groups. The context in Indonesia shows that the limitation of accurate data and bureaucratic capacity are the main challenges in realizing effective legal protection. The Integrated Social Welfare Data System that has been used so far still has weaknesses, especially in terms of real-time data updates, so that many groups affected by the crisis have not been identified quickly and accurately.

The existing literature also underscores the importance of a human rights-based approach as the main foundation in formulating legal protection policies for vulnerable groups. This means that the policies made must guarantee universal access to basic services without discrimination and ensure the existence of an effective and easily accessible complaint mechanism for the community. Conceptually, legal protection for vulnerable groups during a socio-economic crisis can be understood as a complementary combination of a normative framework, which consists of laws and regulations and international conventions; implementation instruments such as social assistance programs, social security, and legal aid services; monitoring mechanisms involving independent institutions such as the ombudsman; as well as the participation and empowerment of the community as active subjects in the protection process. This discussion as a whole confirms that policy reforms must be directed at strengthening cross-sectoral coordination so that

³² María Belén Herrero and Jorgelina Loza, "Building a regional health agenda: a rights-based approach to health in South America," *Global Public Health* 13, no. 9 (2018): 1185.

the implementation of protection can run synergistically, increasing professional and responsive bureaucratic capacity, and empowering vulnerable groups so that they are not only passive recipients of assistance, but can also play an active role in advocating for their rights and participating in decision-making processes that affect their lives.

6. Conclusion

This study concludes that legal protection for vulnerable groups in the midst of socio-economic crises is a complex process that requires the integration of legal frameworks, policies, effective implementation, and active community participation. Regulations in Indonesia and various other countries reflect a normative commitment to the principles of non-discrimination and the fulfillment of human rights. However, gaps in implementation, such as weak coordination between agencies, data limitations, and a lack of participation from vulnerable groups, are still the main challenges that must be overcome. This literature review recommends strengthening a harmonious and human rights-based legal framework, increasing the integration of social data to ensure the distribution of targeted assistance, and increasing bureaucratic capacity and adequate budget allocation. In addition, an easily accessible and responsive complaint mechanism is needed, as well as the empowerment of vulnerable groups so that they can actively participate in policy formulation. Thus, the effectiveness of legal protection is not only measured by the existence of laws, but also by the ability of the state and society to ensure that the rights of vulnerable groups are truly guaranteed in practice.

References

- Alston, Philip. "The populist challenge to human rights." *Journal of Human Rights Practice* 9, no. 1 (2017): 1-15.
- Bhorat, H., Oosthuizen, M., & Stanwix, B. (2021). Social assistance amidst the COVID-19 epidemic in South Africa: a policy assessment. *South African Journal of Economics*, 89(1), 63-81.
- Braun, Joan. "Preventing harm to vulnerable older adults: A social justice perspective." *Research on Social Work Practice* 31, no. 6 (2021): 561-575.
- Bürgi Bonanomi, Elisabeth. "Measuring Human Rights Impacts of Trade Agreements Ideas for Improving the Methodology: Comparing the European Union's Sustainability Impact Assessment Practice and Methodology with Human Rights Impact Assessment Methodology." *Journal of Human Rights Practice* 9, no. 3 (2017): 481-503.
- Disantara, Fradhana Putra. "Tanggung Jawab Negara Dalam Masa Pandemi Covid-19." *JCH (Jurnal Cendekia Hukum)* 6, no. 1 (2020): 48-60.
- Dunn, Gemma, and Matthew Laing. "Policy-makers perspectives on credibility, relevance and legitimacy (CRELE)." *Environmental Science & Policy* 76 (2017): 146-152.
- Dziva, Cowen, Munatsi Shoko, and Ellen F. Zvobgo. "Implementation of the 2006 Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities in Zimbabwe: A review." *African Journal of Disability* 7, no. 1 (2018): 1-7.

- Herrero, María Belén, and Jorgelina Loza. "Building a regional health agenda: a rights-based approach to health in South America." *Global Public Health* 13, no. 9 (2018): 1179-1191.
- Hügel, Stephan, and Anna R. Davies. "Public participation, engagement, and climate change adaptation: A review of the research literature." *Wiley Interdisciplinary Reviews: Climate Change* 11, no. 4 (2020): 1-20.
- Itasari, Endah Rantau. "Equality and non discrimination principles in providing rights with disabilities." *Jurnal Komunikasi Hukum (JKH)* 6, no. 2 (2020): 534-541.
- Pepinsky, Thomas B., Jan H. Pierskalla, and Audrey Sacks. "Bureaucracy and service delivery." *Annual Review of Political Science* 20, no. 1 (2017): 249-268.
- Risdianto, Danang. "Perlindungan Terhadap Kelompok Minoritas Di Indonesia Dalam Mewujudkan Keadilan Dan Persamaan Di Hadapan Hukum." *Jurnal Rechts Vinding: Media Pembinaan Hukum Nasional* 6, no. 1 (2017): 125-142.